

nature." A mere flight of poetic fancy, perhaps, but this time it just happens to be true.

I admit to skepticism when first his attitude became known, that it was one to which he would adhere in all its austerity. It seemed a sign of weakening resolve that he agreed to participate publicly in a festival, first at his long-time residence in Prades and then in the more urban surroundings of Perpignan, to which the world was bidden, tickets were sold, tours advertised, and a salable by-product emerged. He has since found it possible to travel widely and engage in musical activities in many countries, as a pedagogue and conductor. The distinction he has made between conducting and playing may be a narrow one, but if it satisfies his conscience, it can scarcely be questioned by others.

At the beginning, the young generation of musicians who came to venerate and remained to idolize heard greater things, through the aura of their admiration, than he actually performed. "You should," I told a few of them loftily at Perpignan in 1952, "have heard Casals when he was really Casals." Contrary to all probabilities and despite the likeness to platitudes, it must be said that he did, in fact, improve with age. Concentrated work and the recurrent sensation of performing again publicly gradually sharpened his touch, restored the strength to his bow arm, so that his memorable performance at the U.N. in 1958—where he took up with the same Beethoven sonata he had played at his last concert in New York thirty years before—was a cohesion of two legends made one.

If one legend was sufficient to dominate the small world of music decades before, the combination of them clearly gave him access to a distinction attained by few persons of comparable background. One, of course, was Ignace Jan Paderewski, who heeded the call to national service from his fellow Poles in the aftermath of World War I. His presence at the Versailles Conference (where he signed the treaty of peace in the name of Poland in June 1919) gave rise to a celebrated anecdote of the time, involving Georges Clemenceau. Upon being presented to him formally, Clemenceau reportedly said: "You are Ignace Paderewski, the world's greatest pianist, who is now premier of Poland?" As Paderewski bowed graciously in recognition of the compliment, Clemenceau whispered to an aide: "What a comedown!"

Casals's wise separation of political motivation from moral indignation has saved him from any such evaluation. He has, rather, utilized his stature as an artist to make clear to the world of international thought and opinion the reality of his dissent. He has, with those endearing deviations which mark the magnitude of the inner struggle it is for

Pablo Casals: A Discography

THE DISCOGRAPHY WHICH FOLLOWS will not only confirm the general impression that Casals has recorded a good deal over the last five decades, but will also indicate the enduring appeal of many of the recordings which have been reissued in three or four different formats. Two or more catalogue numbers separated only by commas indicate different pressings of the same recording; otherwise, different numbers indicate different recordings. Foreign numbers are given only for recordings not released in this country. Numbers in italics are 78 rpm records, all of which, of course, are discontinued releases. All other numbers are LP unless noted. Only those numbers given in **bold face** type are currently available. Victor and RCA Victor are abbreviated "V"; Columbia is abbreviated "C"; other label names are spelled out.

Casals, Cellist

Bach: *Organ Concerto No. 9 (Recitative)* with Eugene Istomin, piano. **C. ML-4926.**

Bach: "Komm', süßer Tod." Blas-Net, piano. V. 7501, LCT-1002.

Bach: *Pastorale in F (Aria)*. Istomin, piano. **C. ML-4926.**

Bach: *Violin Sonata in A Minor (Andante)* arr. Siloti. Blas-Net, piano. V. 7368.

Bach: *Cello (Gamba) Sonatas Nos. 1-3*. Paul Baumgartner, piano. **C. ML-4349/50.**

Bach: *Suites for Unaccompanied Cello*. V. DM-611 (Nos. 2 & 3), DM-742 (1 & 6) DM-1302 (4 & 5). Nos. 1-6, same recordings: Angel **COLH-16/18**; Suite No. 3 (excerpts): Prelude and Sarabande, C. A-5782; Bourrée, C. A-5697; Gigue, C. A-5875.

Bach: *Orch. Suite No. 3 (Air)*. Otto Schulhof, piano. V. 7368; older versions, C. A-5756, C. 68026D.

Bach: *Toccata, Adagio and Fugue in C (Adagio)* arr. Siloti. N. Mednikoff, piano. V. 6501, V. 6635, V. DM-1302, V. LCT-1050, V. WCT-9 (45), V. LCT-1002, **V. LM-2699.**

Beethoven: *Minuet in G*. Otto Schulhof, piano. V. M-134.

Beethoven: *Sonata in F, Op. 17* (arrangement of Horn Sonata); Mieczyslaw Horszowski, piano. Philips **PHM-500120**, stereo **PHS-900120.**

Beethoven: *Cello Sonatas*. Rudolf Serkin, piano. Nos. 1 & 5, C. ML-4876; No. 2, **C. ML-4572**, ML-4877; Nos. 3 & 4, C. ML-4878; all five, **C. SL-201.**

Beethoven: *Cello Sonatas*. Mieczyslaw Horszowski, piano. Nos. 2 & 5, European Philips **A-00507-L**; No. 1, V. DM-843; No. 2, HMV DB-3911/13; No. 4, V. 14366/67; No. 5, HMV DB-3914/16.

Beethoven: *Cello Sonata No. 3*. Otto Schulhof V. M-134.

Beethoven: *Piano Trio, Op. 1, No. 1*. Joseph Fuchs, violin; Eugene Istomin, piano. C. ML-5291.

Beethoven: *Trio, Op. 1, No. 2*. Alexander Schneider, violin; Istomin, piano. C. ML-4573.

Beethoven: *Trio, Op. 1, No. 3*. Sándor Vegh, violin; Horszowski, piano. Philips **PHM-500120**; stereo, **PHS-900120.**

Beethoven: *Trio, Op. 11*. Schneider, Istomin. C. ML-4571.

Beethoven: *Trio, Op. 70, No. 1*. Vegh, Horszowski, European Philips **G-05365-R**; also Fuchs, Istomin. C. ML-5291.

Beethoven: *Trio, Op. 70, No. 2*. Schneider, Istomin. C. ML-4571.

Beethoven: "Archduke" *Trio, Op. 97*. Jacques Thibaud, violin; Alfred Cortot, piano. V. M-92, Angel **COLH-29**; also

Sándor Vegh, violin; Horszowski, piano. Philips **PHM-500016**, stereo **PHS-900-016**, also Schneider, Istomin. C. ML-4574.

Beethoven: *Variations on Handel's "See the Conqu'ring Hero Comes."* Rudolf Serkin, piano. C. ML-4640.

Beethoven: *Variations on Mozart's "Bei Männern welche Liebe fühlen."* Alfred Cortot, piano. V. 1749/50, Pathé-Marconi **COLH-92.**

Beethoven: *Variations on Mozart's "Bei Männern" and Variations on "Ein Mädchen oder Weibchen."* Rudolf Serkin, piano. **C. ML-4572**, C. ML-4877, **C. SL-201.**

Boccherini: *Concerto in B-flat*. Sir Landon Ronald cond. London Symphony Orch. V. DM-381, V. WCT-41 (45), V. LCT-1028.

Boccherini: *Sonata in A*. Blas-Net, piano. V. 7258; Allegro only: C. 68025D, C. 48710.

Brahms: *Double Concerto*. Jacques Thibaud, violin; Alfred Cortot cond. Casals Orch., Barcelona. V. M-99, Angel **COLH-75.**

Brahms: *Piano Quartet in A, Op. 26*. Sándor Vegh, violin; Georges Janzer, viola; Karl Engel, piano. European Philips **A-02209-L**, stereo **835101-AY.**

Brahms: *Sapphic Ode* (with piano). C. 68089D, 7075M.

Brahms: *Sextet No. 1, Op. 18*. Isaac Stern and Alexander Schneider, violins; Milton Katims and Milton Thomas, violas; Madeline Foley, cello. C. ML-4713.

Brahms: *Sonata in F, Op. 99*. Horszowski piano. V. DM-410.

Brahms: *Trio in B, Op. 8*. Isaac Stern, violin; Myra Hess, piano. C. ML-4719.

Brahms: *Trio in C, Op. 87*. Joseph Szigeti and Myra Hess. C. ML-4720.

Bruch: *Kol Nidrei*. Sir Landon Ronald cond. London Symphony Orch. V. M-680, V. WCT-42 (45), V. LCT-1028; also two recs. with piano. C. A-5722 and C. 68019D.

Campagnoli: *Romanza*. (with piano). C. A-5654.

Casals: *Song of the Birds*. Horszowski, piano. **C. KL-5726**; also Istomin, piano. **C. ML-4926.**

Cassadó: *Requiebro* (with piano). V. 7660.

Chopin: *Nocturne, Op. 9, No. 2*, arr. Popper. Mednikoff, piano. V. 6589, **LM-2699**; and (with piano). C. 68024D, 8901M.

Chopin: *Prélude, Op. 28, No. 15*, arr. Sieving. Mednikoff, piano. V. 6589, **LM-2699.**

Couperin: *Pièces de concert*. Horszowski, piano. **C. KL-5726.**

- Crouch:** "Kathleen Macourneen" (with piano). C. 33008D.
- Cui:** *Berceuse* (with piano). C. 2037M.
- Del Riego:** "Oh, Dry Those Tears" (with piano). C. 2037M.
- Dvorák:** *Concerto in B minor*. George Szell cond. Czech Philharmonic. V. DM-458, WCT-39 (45), LCT-1026, Angel COLH-30; also Alexander Schneider cond. Festival Casals Orch., Puerto Rico. Everest LPBR-6083, stereo SDBR-3083.
- Dvorák:** "Songs My Mother Taught Me." Blas-Net, piano. V. 7193, V. LCT-1050.
- Elgar:** *Concerto in E minor*. Sir Adrian Boult cond. BBC Symphony Orch. HMV DB-6338/41S.
- Elgar:** "Salut d'amour" (with piano). C. A-5679; also C. 33031D.
- Falla:** "Nana," from *Seven Spanish Popular Songs*. Eugene Istomin, piano. C. ML-4926.
- Fauré:** "Après un rêve," arr. Casals. N. Mednikoff, piano. V. 1083; also (with piano). C. A-6020.
- Glazounov:** *Mélodie arabe* (with piano). C. 33030D, 2010M, 184M.
- Godard:** *Berceuse from "Jocelyn"*. Mednikoff, piano. V. 6630, V. LM-2699.
- Goltermann:** *Concerto in A minor* (Cantilena) (with piano). C. A-5847.
- Granados:** "Goyescas" (*Intermezzo*). Mednikoff, piano. V. 6501, V. 6635, V. LCT-1050, V. LM-2699.
- Granados:** *Spanish Dance No. 5*, arr. Casals. Mednikoff, piano. V. 1311; also (with piano). C. A-5847.
- Handel:** "Berenice" (Minuet). C. 2036M.
- Handel:** "Serse" (*Largo*) (with piano). C. 68061D, 7053M; also C. A-5649.
- Haydn:** *Concerto in D, Op. 101 (Adagio)* (with piano). C. 68061D, C. 7053M; also C. A-5875.
- Haydn:** *Piano Sonata No. 9 (Adagio)*. Istomin, piano. C. ML-4926.
- Haydn:** *Sonata for Violin and Viola in C* (Minuet, arr. Piatti). Blas-Net, piano. V. 7501, V. M-680; also C. A-5821.
- Haydn:** *Trio No. 1 in G*. Thibaud and Cortot. V. 3045/46X, Angel COLH-12.
- Hillemacher:** *Gavotte tendre*. Mednikoff, piano. V. LM-2699.
- Kreisler:** *Chanson Louis XIII et Pavane* (with piano). C. A-5907.
- Lassen:** "Thine Eyes So Blue." (with piano). C. 33032D, 2009M.
- Liszt:** *Liebestraum No. 3* (with piano). C. 68023D; also C. A-5756.
- MacDowell:** "To a Wild Rose" (with piano). C. 33030D, C. 2010M, C. 184M.
- Mendelssohn:** *Song without Words for Cello, Op. 109*. Blas-Net, piano. V. 7193, V. LCT-1050.
- Mendelssohn:** *Song without Words, Op. 62, No. 6; "Spring Song"* (with piano). C. A-6020.
- Mendelssohn:** *Song without Words, Op. 67, No. 6, "Serenade"* (with piano). C. 33048D, C. 2011M.
- Mendelssohn:** *Trio in D minor, Op. 49*. Cortot and Thibaud V. M-126, Angel COLH-75; also Schneider and Horszowski. C. KL-5726.
- Mozart:** *Quintet in D, K. 593 (Larghetto)* (with piano). C. A-5953.
- Popper:** *Chanson villageoise*. E. Gendron, piano. V. 1083.
- Popper:** *Gavotte in D* (with piano). C. 68025D.
- Popper:** *Mazurka* (with piano). C. A-5697.
- Popper:** *Serenade (Spanish Dance No. 2)*. C. A-5650.
- Popper:** *Vito. Mednikoff, piano. V. 1311.*
- Rimsky-Korsakov:** "Flight of the Bumblebee." Blas-Net, piano. V. 7193, V. LCT-1050.
- Rubinstein:** *Melody in F*. Mednikoff, piano. V. 1178, V. LCT-1050; also C. A-5649; also C. 68026D.
- Rubinstein:** *Romance* (with piano). C. 33031D, C. 2021M.
- Saint-Saëns:** *Allegro Appassionato, Op. 43* (with piano). C. A-5821.
- Saint-Saëns:** "The Swan." Mednikoff, piano. V. 1143, V. LCT-1002, V. LCT-1050, V. LM-6088, V. LM-2699; also (with piano). C. 68027D, C. 7021M, C. 5092M, also C. A-5650.
- Schubert:** *Moment Musical, Op. 94, No. 3*. Mednikoff, piano. V. 1143, V. LCT-1050, V. LM-2699.
- Schubert:** *Quintet in C, Op. 163*. Stern, Schneider, Katims, and Tortelier. C. ML-4714; also with Vegh Quartet, European Philips A-02208-L, stereo 835100-AY.
- Schubert:** *Trio in B-flat, Op. 99*. Thibaud and Cortot. V. M-11, V. LCT-1141, Angel C. LH-12; also with Schneider and Istomin. C. ML-4715.
- Schubert:** *Trio in E-flat, Op. 100*. Schneider and Horszowski. C. ML-4716.
- Schumann:** "Abendlied." Mednikoff, piano. V. 6630; also (with piano). C. 68024D, C. 7020M, C. 5091M; also C. A-5907.
- Schumann:** *Adagio and Allegro, Op. 70*. Horszowski, piano. C. KL-5726.
- Schumann:** *Cello Concerto*. Prades Festival Orch., supposedly conducted by Eugene Ormandy. C. ML-4926.
- Schumann:** *Fünf Stücke im Volkston, Op. 102*. Leopold Mannes, piano. C. ML-4718.
- Schumann:** "Träumerei." Otto Schulhof, piano. V. 1178, V. LCT-1050; also (with piano). C. 68023D, C. 7020M, C. 5091M; also A-5679.
- Schumann:** *Trio in D minor, Op. 63*. Thibaud and Cortot. V. M-52, V. LCT-1141, Pathé-Marconi COLH-301; also Schneider and Horszowski. C. ML-4718.
- Sgambati:** *Serenata Napoletana* (with piano). C. 2036M.
- Tartini:** *Concerto in D major (Grave ed espressivo)* with piano. V. 7660.
- Tartini:** *Concerto in D minor (Adagio)* (with piano). C. A-5654.
- Tchaikovsky:** *Autumn Song* (with piano). C. 68089D, C. 7075M.
- Tchaikovsky:** *Melody in E-flat* (with piano). C. 33048D, C. 2011M.
- Wagner:** "Meistersinger" (*Prize Song*). Mednikoff, piano. V. 6620, V. LCT-1050, V. LM-2699.
- Wagner:** "Tannhäuser" ("Evening Star"). Mednikoff, piano. V. 6620, V. LCT-1050, V. LM-2699; also (with piano). C. 68027D, C. 7021M, C. 5092M; also C. A-5953.
- Anon.:** "Believe Me if All Those Endearing Young Charms" (with piano). C. 33008D, C. 2021M.
- Anon.:** "Would God I Were the Tender Apple Blossom" (*Londonderry Air*). C. 33032D, C. 2009M.
- Collection:** "The Art of Pablo Casals." Bach, Rubinstein, Schubert, Fauré, Wagner, et al., c. 1926. V. LM-2699.
- Collection:** "Encores by Casals." Bach, Schubert, Mendelssohn, etc. (some, but not all, items in LM-2699). V. LCT-1050.
- Collection:** Recital of Bach, Haydn, Falla and Casals ("Song of the Birds"), with the Schumann Concerto: C. ML-4926.
- Collection:** "A Concert at the White House." Couperin, Schumann, Casals, Mendelssohn. C. KL-5726.

(Casals items listed above have also appeared in various miscellaneous collections on Victor, and the 1951 Perpignan and 1952 Prades Festival recordings were gathered into multi-disc albums on Columbia, as well as being offered on single LPs.)

Casals, Conductor

- Bach:** *Brandenburg Concertos Nos. 1-6* (Marlboro Festival, 1965). C. M2L-331, stereo M2S-731 (set includes rehearsal disc); also (Prades Festival, 1950). C. ML-4345-47.
- Bach:** *Clavier Concerto in F minor* (Clara Haskil, piano; Prades 1950). C. ML-4353.
- Bach:** *Concerto for Clavier, Violin, Flute and Orch.* (Horszowski, piano, A. Schneider, violin; John Wummer, flute; Prades 1950). C. ML-4352.
- Bach:** *Violin Concerto in A minor* (Isaac Stern; Prades 1950). C. ML-4353.
- Bach:** *Violin Concerto in D minor* (Joseph Szigeti; Prades 1950). C. ML-4352.
- Bach:** *Concerto for Two Violins* (Stern and Schneider; Prades 1950). C. ML-4351.
- Bach:** *Concerto for Violin, Oboe and Orch.* Isaac Stern, Marcel Tabuteau; Prades 1950. C. ML-4351.
- Bach:** *St. Matthew Passion* ("Erbarme dich"). Jennie Tourel; Perpignan Festival Orch. C. ML-4640.
- Bach:** *Suites Nos. 1 & 2 for Orchestra* (Prades Festival 1950, with Wummer, flute). C. ML-4348.
- Beethoven:** "Coriolan" Overture. London Symphony Orch. V. 9729, V. 36291.
- Beethoven:** "Ruins of Athens" Overture (Casals Orch.; Barcelona) in HMV set M-96.
- Beethoven:** *Symphony No. 1* (Casals Orch.; Barcelona). HMV D-1729/31 (announced as V. M-159, but evidently never released in this country).
- Beethoven:** *Symphony No. 4* (Casals Orch.; Barcelona). HMV set M-96, portions on V. L-11600 (old coarse-groove LP).
- Boccherini:** *Cello Concerto in B-flat*, ed. Gendron as "Original Version" (Maurice Gendron, cello; Lamoureux Orch.). Epic LC-3817; stereo, BC-1152.
- Brahms:** *Variations on a Theme by Haydn* (London Symphony Orch.). V. 9287/89, V. G-16.
- Haydn:** *Cello Concerto in D, Op. 101* (Gendron and Lamoureux Orch.). Epic LC-3817; stereo, BC-1152.
- Mozart:** *Aria "Non temer, amato bene"* (Jennie Tourel; Perpignan Festival). C. ML-4640.
- Mozart:** *Flute Concerto No. 1, K. 313* (John Wummer; Perpignan Festival). C. ML-4567.
- Mozart:** *Piano Concerto No. 9, K. 271* (Myra Hess; Perpignan Festival). C. ML-4568.
- Mozart:** *Piano Concerto No. 14, K. 449* (Continued on page 59)

him to forego the greatest joy of his life—the making of music—added a legend of denial to all those of self-indulgence with which we are familiar.

But, as the big world of Don Pablo extends an embrace that reaches from the Yellow Sea to the White House on this momentous occasion, it should be remembered that he is merely on loan from the world of music, which knew him first and still contends it knows him best. Others may try to draw words from him to express what he feels at reaching ninety, in health, with a young wife to watch over him, and with a host of devoted friends to wish him well. But he has said all that needs to be said, musically, on the subject in the latest discs to join the long succession of records itemized herewith.

Included is a coupling of Beethoven's Symphony No. 8 and Mendelssohn's *Italian* made with the "students"—almost all of them professionals of high standing—who gather each summer at the Marlboro Festival presided over by Rudolf Serkin. Primarily, they come to refresh themselves from the stresses and strains of the workaday pursuits that occupy them the year 'round . . . but, if their timing is right they may have the special stimulation of participating in sessions with such "visiting" professors as Casals.

How stimulating can be comprehended only from listening to Columbia MS 6931 (\$5.79, stereo, or \$4.79 for its mono equivalent, ML 6331). The recording session bears the date of June 1963, which means that Casals was nearly eighty-seven at the time. But, if one is to judge from the vitality, thrust, forward impulse, and abiding musicality of the results, the only difference would be, at ninety, even more vitality, thrust, forward impulse, and musicality.

How these two works happened to appear on the agenda for this session—which was hastily arranged when the results Casals achieved with the improvised ensemble seemed much too good not to be preserved—may have been an accident, but what a happy accident! Aside from intrinsic quality—which could be duplicated in dozens of others from the literature—each has a special identity with the man who conducts them. In the Beethoven, it is the magnitude of expression contained within the "little" Eighth, the rollicking humors which are still not without ironic overtones; in the Mendelssohn, it is the timeless spirit of youth that surges through patterns warm with the same Mediterranean sun known to Casals from his earliest days. And, as no important act of Casals's life would be complete without invoking his own, personal, four-letter "Amen"—spelled B-A-C-H—the symphonies are paralleled by a recording of the four Overtures, or orchestral Suites, of the same date. (Col-

(Continued on page 59)



—Dora Harvey.

(Above) Preparing for a performance in the Vienna Brahms Festival of 1933: Artur Schnabel at the piano, Bronislaw Huberman, violin (left) and Paul Hindemith, viola. (Below) Performing at the United Nations, 1958.



—Culver.

Recordings in Review

The Other Miss Menuhin

BEETHOVEN: *Sonata in B flat (Op. 22)*. MENDELSSOHN: *Variations Sérieuses (Op. 54)*. LISZT: "Forest Murmurs"; "Dance of the Gnomes." Yaltah Menuhin, piano. Everest stereo, 3146, \$4.98; mono, 6146, \$4.98.

WHATEVER else it may confer, having a famous name may often be as much a burden as an asset. In the case of Yaltah Menuhin, the burden has been sufficient for both shoulders. For, in addition to the shadow cast by her celebrated brother, she also has a piano-playing sister who, being earlier on the scene, absorbed the world's attention as "another" first-class musician in the Menuhin family. (Even the biographical sketch of Yehudi in Grove's *Dictionary* refuses to acknowledge that he has more than one sister, and that one named Hephzibah.)

A typically strong-minded member of a strong-minded family, this "other" Miss Menuhin has made a life and a career of her own on the West Coast. This has given rise to a series of duo piano records with Joel Ryce and other ensemble collaborations, but not, so far as I can discover, too much in the way of solo performance. The quality of what is to be heard here supports the belief that, if a Menuhin by any other name would be a fine musician, a pianist by this one hasn't received all the attention she merits.

It is a sample of the discrimination that informs her playing that Miss Menuhin has chosen the early B-flat Sonata of Beethoven of which, aside from the

versions in complete series of the sonatas, there is only one recording—by Sviatoslav Richter. Hers is full of lyric freshness, a comprehensive sense of structure and a willingness to accept it for what it is rather than to inflate it beyond its inherent dimensions. She does especially well by the flowing finale (so much akin to the contemporaneous F-major, Op. 24, Violin Sonata). Miss Menuhin matches well to the requirements of Mendelssohn and likewise chooses thoughtfully in selecting the kind of Liszt to which her lightness and delicacy are appropriate.

Hollander in the XIX Century

BEETHOVEN: *Sonata in D minor (Op. 31, No. 3)*. SCHUMANN: *Arabeske (Op. 18)*. BRAHMS: *Intermezzo in B-flat minor (Op. 117, No. 2)*. BACH-HESS: "Jesu, Joy of Man's Desiring." Lorin Hollander, piano. RCA Victor stereo, LSC 2912, \$5.79, mono, LM 2912, \$4.79.

THE interest-arousing factor of this disc is not what is being played, but who is playing it. For, either by choice or dictation, Lorin Hollander's attention, on previous recordings, has been directed to such composers of the present as Khatchaturian, or of the relatively recent past (Bloch, Ravel, Prokofiev) with an outer perimeter at Rachmaninoff and Mussorgsky. This has also seemed to me a misreading, at least in part, of the musicianship which I first heard demonstrated in a Mozart concerto when Hollander was all of eleven.

It is gratifying to discover that the disposition is still present despite the considerable success that Hollander has enjoyed, and the kinds of works through which it has been achieved. Especially impressive is the re-creation of the Beethoven Sonata—clean, articulate, beautifully controlled. One sometimes has the sensation that he is operating on it with a surgical objectivity, laying bare the details of structural relationship rather than conveying his emotional response to the work as a whole. But Hollander's cool kind of command makes one realize that there is more than one way of viewing a musical expression on this scale, and his is observed from the vantage point of literate musicality and serious purpose.

If there is a respect in which Hollander's playing both of the Sonata and the shorter works falls short of the highest objectives, it is in the matter of piano tone. His treatment of the Schumann *Arabeske* is full of happy turns of phrase,

of sensitive response to opportunities for lyric statement, but the piano sound in which they are restated strikes me almost as ascetic in its application of the resonance and depth that the instrument can yield. One might suggest that this is a carry-over from his absorption with the twentieth-century literature for which a more percussive tone production is wholly valid. But this would imply that Hollander, as an artist, is limited to one kind of expression, which is plainly disproved by his sympathy with the range of music on this record.

A Memento of Fine

FINE: *Symphony 1962*. *The Boston Symphony conducted by the composer*. *Serious Song; Toccata Concertante*. *The Boston Symphony conducted by Erich Leinsdorf*. RCA Victor stereo, LSC 2829, \$5.79; mono, LM 2829, \$4.79.

ACCORDING to everything that has accumulated about the late Irving Fine since his death in 1962, he was a musician of sympathetic spirit and generally admirable traits who enjoyed the esteem of some of the most distinguished colleagues of the day (Aaron Copland, for example, contributes a warming word of tribute to this issue). A native of Boston, Fine lived most of his life in that community, working at Harvard with Piston (one of his contemporaries was Leonard Bernstein), returning to teach there, and later at Brandeis.

The three works herein reproduced span a period from 1948 (*Toccata Concertante*) to 1962 (*Symphony*), with the *Serious Song* at the midway point of 1955. They share a large sense of assurance in writing for the orchestra (in the case of the *Serious Song*, for strings alone), an attractive economy of style, and a disposition to treat the listener as an adult participant in the composer's thinking—by which I mean that there is no discernible padding; he says what he wants to say directly and succinctly.

These are all valuable traits, but Fine lacks, to my way of hearing, the most valuable of all—anything like originality. That, to be sure, is the province of but a few in any historical period; but most composers who reach the age that Fine did when the *Symphony* was introduced (forty-eight) have found a way of assimilating their inheritance to the point where, if it does not sound like anyone special, it does not sound like everyone in general. The *Serious Song* comes close to establishing a mood and vocabulary suggestive of an individual voice, but in the *Symphony* there is such a clamor of others—ranging across such S's as Shostakovich, Stravinsky, and Schuman—that isolation of Fine's own voice is difficult. Leinsdorf's direction of the



Menuhin—"full of lyric freshness."